Building a Safe and Healthy America: Strategies to Eliminate the Use of Corporal Punishment

Problem

Children’s hospitals should be a healthy/safe environment
Staff witness:
Harsh discipline
Upsetting to patients, parents, visitors, and staff
What is our role as hospital staff?
Obligation to ensure safety
But may not feel empowered to intervene

Objectives

• Discuss violence in our society
• Describe literature related to corporal punishment use
• Explore global initiatives to eliminate corporal punishment use
• Describe pediatric health care initiative – No Hit Zone

Gail Hornor, DNP, CPNP, SANE-P
Katie Doughty, MSN, CPNP
– Center for Family Safety and Healing
– Emergency Department

The speakers have no conflicts of interest to disclose
**Child Soldiers**

Child Soldiers (<18yo): 300,000 are active in conflicts worldwide currently.

40% of armed forces in the world use children.

10,000 child soldiers killed in 2017.

International Day Against the Use of Child Soldiers (Feb 12)

[UNICEF/UN]


---

**Terrorism**

---

**Child Deaths Due to Terrorism Worldwide**

2015 = 17+

2016 = 78+

2017 = 130+

---

**Mass Shootings**

Las Vegas (2017)

58 dead

546 injured

---

**Mass Shootings US**

Since 1966
(tally began 8/1/66)

1,153
killed

189
children and teenagers

*Several definitions of Mass Shootings
*4+ shot in one incident at one location at roughly the same time
(mass shooting tracker)


---

**Homicides**

Columbus, Ohio

2018: 103 (11.7 per 100,000)

2017: 143 (16.2 per 100,000)

2016: 106 (12.2 per 1000,000)

2015: 77 (9 per 100,000)

2014: 87 (10.3 per 100,000)

New York City, NY

2018: 289 (3.3 per 100,000)

2017: 292 (3.4 per 100,000)

2016: 334 (3.3 per 100,000)

2015: 339 (3.9 per 100,000)

2014: 328 (2.2 per 100,000)
School Shootings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Decade</th>
<th>Deaths</th>
<th>Injuries</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1840’s-1930’s (100 years)</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1940’s-1980’s (50 years)</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990’s (10 years)</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2000’s (10 years)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Deaths</th>
<th>Injuries</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2010-2018</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

178 Deaths/290 Injuries

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_school_shootings_in_the_United_States

School

Bullying

- 10% - 15% kindergarten
- 20% - 50% high school
- 52% cyberbullying

Home

Domestic violence

- over 10 million women and men are victims of DV each year in the US (CDC)

Violence

Abuse

- Physical
- Sexual
- Neglect

- Nearly 700,000 children are abused annually

Society

Approval of corporal punishment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Approval</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1984</td>
<td>84%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Use of corporal punishment

- 2016: 61% of women report hitting their children as a form of discipline
- 2018: School corporal punishment is legal in 19 states

Society

Approval

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Approval</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Use

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Use</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What Does Research Tell Us?

The more children are spanked, the greater risk that they will experience physical abuse at the hands of their parents.

Lee, Grogan-Kaylor, & Berger, 2014
Sanapo & Nakamura, 2011
Zolster et al 2008
Gragne et al 2007
Foshee et al 2005
Bugental, Marshall, & Barranta, 2003
Fino-Armenia 2002

Punishment Gone Awry

Spanking is associated with more child aggression

Gershoff & Grogan-Kaylor 2016
Westbrook et al 2013
Gershoff et al 2010
Berlin et al 2009
Pagani et al 2004

Spanking is associated with more child antisocial behavior

Gershoff & Grogan-Kaylor 2016
Lynan et al 2009
Christie-Mizell et al 2008
McLoyd et al 2007
Kohrt et al 2004
Kau et al 2003
**Link**

Spanking is linked with more child mental health problems

Gershoff & Grogan-Kaylor 2016
Lynan et al 2009
Christie-Mizell et al 2008
McLoyd et al 2007
Kohrt et al 2004
Kau et al 2003

---

**Link**

Spanking is associated with impaired child cognitive ability

Gershoff & Grogan-Kaylor 2016
Maguire-Jack et al 2012
Straus & Paschall 2009
Berlin et al 2009
Oysterman et al 2005
Gest et al 2004

---

**Link**

Spanking has negative effects on the parent-child relationship

Gershoff & Grogan-Kaylor 2016
Coyl et al 2002
Palmer & Hollin 2001
Joubert 1991
Kandel 1990
Larzelere et al 1989

---

**Adverse Childhood Experiences Study**


Relationship between childhood experiences and adult health

More than 18,000 adult members of Kaiser Health Plan were surveyed

---

**ACE**

**Childhood exposures**

- Child maltreatment
- Exposure to domestic violence
- Household substance abuse
- Household mental illness
- Criminal household member
- Parental separation and divorce

---

**ACE**

**Adult behaviors**

- Diet, exercise, tobacco, alcohol, drug

**Adult health**

- Mental and physical
ACE

Interrelatedness of adverse childhood experiences

If reported one ACE likelihood of having another was 2 to 18 times higher than those having 0

If reporting one ACE 86.5% reported at least one additional ACE and 52% reported at least 3 additional ACEs

ACE

Affi, Ford, Gershoff, et al, 2017

Spanking associated with similar outcomes to ACEs (especially physical and emotional abuse)

Spanking should be considered an ACE

Corporal Punishment

Society's beliefs and what influences those beliefs?

Discussion Points

Parents have the right to determine how best to discipline their children

That right is not without limits

Children are not property with whom we can do as we wish

Society has evolved concerning these concepts in the last 20-30 years.

Discipline

Children need discipline

Keep them safe

Make them feel secure

Help them become responsible adults

Spanking v Beating

Spanking

Hitting with an open hand on the seat of the pants without leaving permanent marks

Beating

Hitting with a fist, a belt, a cord, a switch, a spoon a brush or other object; hitting with an open hand any place other than seat of the pants; spanking that leaves permanent marks
### Influences on Beliefs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Influence</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family who were disciplined</td>
<td>477</td>
<td>64.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family members</td>
<td>271</td>
<td>37.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friends/other parents</td>
<td>227</td>
<td>30.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spouse/partner</td>
<td>192</td>
<td>26.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical/health care provider</td>
<td>234</td>
<td>32.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious beliefs</td>
<td>179</td>
<td>25.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>9.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Stats

- Fewer than 1/5 of learners who were also parents (n=126; 14.4%) stated that their child’s health care provider had ever discussed child discipline with them.
- Fewer than 1/2 (n=365; 46%) stated that child discipline had been a part of their professional education.

### Beliefs

- 62% spanking can be abusive
- 42% spanking is sometimes necessary
- 14% children who are never spanked are spoiled
- 20% spanking is never OK
- 69% substitute nonphysical discipline

### Global Initiatives to End Corporal Punishment
UNICEF: Rights of the Child

Article 19

Protection from all forms of violence

There are ways to discipline children that are effective in helping children learn about family and societal expectations for their behavior – ones that are non-violent, are appropriate to the child's level of development and take the best interests of the child into consideration.

Laws Prohibiting Corporal Punishment by Country

- Argentina: 2014 prohibiting all corporal punishment
- Austria: 1989: “using violence and inflicting physical or mental suffering is unlawful”
- Denmark: 1997: “The child has right to care and security. It must be treated with respect for its person and must not be subjected to corporal punishment or other humiliating treatment.”
- Finland: 1983: CP of children explicitly banned
- Germany: 2000: “Children have right to a non-violent upbringing. Corporal punishment, psychological violence and other degrading educational measures are inadmissible.”
- Ireland: 2015: the Children First Act: corporal punishment has been definitively criminalized.
- Norway: 2010: “any violence against children, including careful slaps, is prohibited”.
- Poland: 2010: law explicitly prohibits parent use of corporal punishment
- South Africa: 2017: “all corporal punishment of children by adults became prohibited”

Scotland

2018: J. Finnie to lodge Member’s Bill to give children Equal Protection from assault, after securing support from across Holyrood’s five parties

2019 update: moving forward, not yet passed

Wales

2019: Ban on smacking children: removes “reasonable punishment” as a defense

Children (Abolition of Reasonable Punishment) Bill: has not passed assembly as of yet

Violence: Where are We Now?

- Children’s Hospitals should be a healthy/safe environment
- Staff witness
  - Harsh discipline
  - Upsetting to patients, parents, visitors, and staff
- What is our role as staff?
  - Obligation to ensure safety
  - May not feel empowered to intervene

Problem
No Hit Zone

Originally developed in 2005 at Rainbow Babies and Children Hospital in Cleveland, Ohio

Implemented by several children’s hospitals

Willing to share their experiences and materials

Rainbow Babies and Children Hospital
Cincinnati Children’s Hospital
Kosair Children’s Hospital
Riley Children’s Hospital
Mercy Children’s Hospital
Mott Children’s Hospital

No Hit Zone

Nationwide Children’s Hospital
Norton Children’s Hospital
Gundersen Medical Center
UW Health & American Family Children’s Hospital

Children’s Hospital of New Orleans
Greenville Health System Children’s Hospital
Wolfson Children’s Hospital
University of Rochester Medical Center

No Hit Zone

Kosair Children’s Hospital 2012

Subjective success
High demand for No Hit Zone beyond initial pilot facilities
No Hit Zone toolkit assembled and publicized by Kentucky Chapter of AAP

No Hit Zone Journey

Many medical staff witness parent to child hitting
Although some staff reported intervening
Findings indicate staff need training to identify when and how the
should respond

No Hit Zone
Timeline
Spring 2015
Concept introduced to Chief Nursing Officer
Champions appointed
Summer 2015-Summer 2016
Stakeholder meetings
Education plan development
Education roll-out Fall 2017

Hitting Harms, Hugging Helps
NCH has taken the concepts and made the No Hit Zone our own!

Hitting can have long term effects on your child’s body, mind and spirit.
Here are better options:
• Time-out
• Distraction
• Sticker charts
• House rules
• Logical consequences and explicit why

Hitting Harms, Hugging Helps
Concepts
NCH is an environment where no adult shall hit a child and no adult shall verbally abuse a child

When hitting or verbal abuse is observed, it is everyone’s responsibility to interrupt the behavior and offer assistance to diffuse the situation

Zero Hero (Stop & Resolve, ARCC)
TMWR (take the HEAT)

Hospital-wide rollout
2017
Super user trainings
Experts for unit/department
Live trainings
Non-clinical staff
Abbreviated training at staff meeting
Clinical staff
Learning Center training

Hitting Harms, Hugging Helps
Family Education

http://anchor.columbuschildrens.net/Document/Get/103352 Discipline brochure
http://www.zeroabuseproject.org/thisisanohitzine
http://www.gundersenhealth.org/ncptc/center-for-effective-discipline/resources-for-parents/training-materials/
Digital Signage

For 4 year olds...
- pp. of paper are all being hung from wall
- pp. of paper are all hanging from wall
- pp. of paper are all hanging from wall
- pp. of paper are all hanging from wall
- pp. of paper are all hanging from wall

For babies...
- pp. of paper are all hanging from wall
- pp. of paper are all hanging from wall
- pp. of paper are all hanging from wall
- pp. of paper are all hanging from wall
- pp. of paper are all hanging from wall
- pp. of paper are all hanging from wall

Hitting Harms, Hugging Helps

Our role as healthcare providers
Positive parenting
Realistic developmental expectations
Parents as role models
Importance of praise
Explaining rules / values
Alternatives to harsh discipline
Time-out
Distraction
Sticker charts
House rules
Logical outcomes

Embedded in NCH culture

Treat Me with Respect:
- Take the HEAT (hear the family out, empathize, apologize, take action)
- Zero Hero
- Stop & Resolve
- ARCC

Nice Use of HHHH Tools

Things Worth Sharing: Empowered to Act
1. Hear the family out
2. Empathize that it was an early morning
3. Take action - grabbing another wagon & offering a book to distract the kids

Search Hugging Helps or ANCHOR for details.

Things Worth Sharing: The Situation
Liz Nesterger, an early intervention specialist, noticed a family with two young children in the lobby.

The kids were not sharing or listening to the mother's request to get along, and the father was getting frustrated with the sibling children.

Not so Nice Use of HHHH Tools

The Situation
- Off-site laboratory
- Child upset about blood work
- Mother yelling at child threatening to hit
- Mother and child in lobby and escalating
- Protective services told her to stop or call CPS
- Mother escalated and CPS called
Sustainability

Zero Hero Safety Coaches
Additional trainings
- New Super Users
- On-boarding within Zero Hero training
- Annual required education via Learning Center

What’s New?

AAP in a new position statement November of 2018 opposes the use of corporal punishment

http://pediatrics.aappublications.org/content/pediatrics/142/6/e20183112.full.pdf

References


Contacts

- Gail.hornor@nationwidechildrens.org
- Katharine.doughty@nationwidechildrens.org

No Hit Zone materials curtsey of Rainbow Babies and Children’s Hospital (Lauren MacLily, PNP)
- Complete list available upon request
THANK YOU